
MEMORANDUM

TO: Board of Supervisors
FROM: Solid Waste Team
SUBJECT: Award/Rejection of Bid for Trash and Recycling Hauler
DATE: September 19, 2024



Motion:

To **award or reject** the bid for the collection of residential waste and recyclable materials, monthly bulk trash pick-up, up to 11 leaf/branch curbside pick-ups, and one Christmas tree pick-up at an initial annual cost of \$1,454,399.96.

Bid Analysis:

Bid specifications were posted on Penn Bid after the Board of Supervisors authorized the advertisement. Two haulers submitted bids according to the various options included in our specifications, as detailed below. A.J. Blosenski was the lowest overall bidder for trash, recycling, leaf, and Christmas tree collection, with the option of the Township owning the recycling material. One hauler submitted a "No Bid."

Fees:

For comparison, the current contracted rate for 2024 is \$800,245. The proposed 2026 rate of \$1,454,399.96 represents an 81.7% increase in hauling costs.

While the Township receives grant funds through participation in the Act 101, Section 904 grant program, a solid waste fee increase would be necessary to cover the proposed bid's increased cost. For instance, maintaining the current trash bag cost at \$2.50 per bag while raising the annual fee from \$89 to \$240 would result in the average participant's annual cost increasing from \$219 to \$370, a 69% increase.

A.J. Blosenski, Inc.: Collection of Residential Waste and Recyclable Material with Township owning Recyclable Material Monthly bulk pick up

Year	Trash & Rec.	Leaf Pickup	Chr. trees	Bid Total
2026	\$1,382,400	\$57,600	\$14,400	\$1,454,400
2027	\$1,465,344	\$61,056	\$15,264	\$1,541,664
2028	\$1,553,265	\$64,719	\$16,180	\$1,634,164
2029	\$1,677,529	\$69,897	\$17,474	\$1,764,900
2030	\$1,811,728	\$75,489	\$18,872	\$1,908,089
5-Yr Total	\$7,891,265	\$328,761	\$82,190	\$8,301,217

A.J. Blosenski, Inc.: Collection of Residential Waste and Recyclable Material with Contractor owning Recyclable Material Monthly bulk pick up.

Year	Trash & Rec.	Leaf Pickup	Chr. tree	Bid Total
2026	\$1,368,000	\$57,600	\$14,400	\$1,440,000
2027	\$1,450,080	\$61,056	\$15,264	\$1,526,400
2028	\$1,537,085	\$64,719	\$16,180	\$1,617,984
2029	\$1,660,052	\$69,897	\$17,474	\$1,747,422
2030	\$1,792,856	\$75,489	\$18,872	\$1,887,217
5-Yr Total	\$7,808,072	\$328,761	\$82,190	\$8,219,023

J.P. Mascaro & Son: Collection of Residential Waste and Recyclable Material with Township owning Recyclable Material Monthly bulk pick up

Year	Trash & Rec.	Leaf Pickup	Ch. Trees	Bid Total
2026	\$2,013,744	\$131,395	\$11,945	\$2,157,084
2027	\$2,048,868	\$133,694	\$12,154	\$2,194,716
2028	\$2,097,984	\$136,895	\$12,445	\$2,247,324
2029	\$2,155,884	\$140,679	\$12,789	\$2,309,352
2030	\$2,225,772	\$145,233	\$13,203	\$2,384,208
5-Yr Total	\$10,542,252	\$687,896	\$62,536	\$11,292,684

J.P. Mascaro & Son: Collection of Residential Waste and Recyclable Material with Contractor owning Recyclable Material Monthly bulk pick up

Year	Trash & Rec.	Leaf Pickup	Chr. Trees	Bid Total
2026	\$2,212,740	\$131,395	\$11,945	\$2,356,080
2027	\$2,252,196	\$133,694	\$12,154	\$2,398,044
2028	\$2,306,604	\$136,895	\$12,445	\$2,455,944
2029	\$2,370,456	\$140,679	\$12,789	\$2,523,924
2030	\$2,447,148	\$145,233	\$13,203	\$2,605,584
5-Yr Total	\$11,589,144	\$687,896	\$62,536	\$12,339,576

Background and Board Discussion of Next Steps:

West Whiteland Township is currently in the fourth year of a five-year contract with A.J. Blosenski for trash and recycling collection. Although the contract runs through December 31, 2025, the Township began the bid process early to ensure a smooth transition.

Currently Township residents pay an average of \$219/year with 1 bag per week. Residents in other municipalities typically pay \$375-450/year.

As discussed in July, Township staff is currently evaluating trash and recycling program options (see attached evaluation). Questions being explored by the Township include:

- should the Township continue as is
- what tweaks/changes should be made to the present program
- should we go with all totes and a hauler contract
- bring the operation in-house

Resident and Commission Feedback:

In early August, the **Public Services Commission** discussed the present Pay-as-you-Throw (PAYT) program and the bid results. While no recommendation was made to the Board of Supervisors, their feedback included:

Totes or no totes:

- totes for trash will eliminate the “anti-bag” sentiments as well as eliminate the environmental concerns over plastic when residents place trash in a plastic bag which then in turn goes into another plastic bag (the PAYT bag)
- some residents cannot fit the big totes into their garages
- all companies appear to be automating operations with totes which may make the PAYT system unsustainable in the near future

Customer Service:

- present hauler’s level of customer service has declined with Township Staff devoting a lot of time to document each missed service as well as deal with the e-mails and phone calls from irate residents
- when trash is not picked up on time, animals can get into the bags and the trash blows around the neighborhoods. The current contract calls for missed trash to be picked up within 24 hours, but numerous times it has been one or even two weeks before missed trash is picked up
- staff has met with the hauler six times over the last two years to discuss the poor service, but the hauler still has no plan to proceed differently, has difficulty with employee turnover, and general logistics

In-House versus Contracting Services:

- a hybrid system with bags and totes
- pick up trash over a period of a few days rather than all in one day. This would allow operating with fewer trucks.
- the goal should be a system that is cost effective, equitable, promotes recycling, and saves landfill space
- costs of both options are similar
- the overhead costs of an in-house system are big but would allow for more control over the program and as well planning and budgeting for future years
- for most big projects, the Township does not proceed unless they can secure grant funding
- the “pay for what you use” principle would be gone with an in-house system but understands that this may be the future.

Staff has shared the bid results with the public to give residents ample time to plan and budget for a cost increase for solid waste collection. **Public response** has resulted in the following opinions/suggestions:

PAYT versus non-PAYT

- those in favor of continuing the PAYT program assert that it’s fairer for those

- households that do not generate a lot of trash and that it promotes recycling
- other households are “fed up” with the PAYT program, citing that it is inconvenient to buy the bags, unsanitary, unsafe, and drives up the cost for larger households

Advise against bringing collection in-house – leave it to the experts

Requests for more specifics about why price is going up so much, especially when service has declined.

Suggestions to transition to all totes to automate collection and make it safer

Next Steps:

Discussion of Options

Attachments:

No Bid Letter from Republic

Cost Analysis – Contracted Services and In-House Services

Evaluation of Trash & Recycling Options



Sustainability in Action

July 30, 2024

West Whiteland Township
101 Commerce Drive
Exton PA 19341

Dear West Whiteland Township,

Regrettably, Republic Services will not be submitting a bid on your upcoming RESIDENTIAL WASTE COLLECTION AND DISPOSAL AND RECYCLING COLLECTION AND DISPOSAL contract. We believe it is in the best interest of the public that municipal services are competitively contracted, and Republic Services intends to compete for work in our marketplace.

Republic Services no bid response is based mainly around the issues of safety, the PAYT program as currently set up, can only be completed with rear load trucks and driver helper teams. We have decided to move away from this type of service and are only participating in municipal/residential contracts that allow for the use of automated side-load trucks. The ASL collection method does not expose our workers to the obvious hazards of collecting containers off the back of the vehicle.

We also recommend allowing the winning contractor to spread out the collection service over multiple days rather than just one.

We wish you the best during this process and we would consider bidding in the future should the safety issues be addressed. I'd be happy to answer any follow-up questions you may have.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Dominic Fulginiti".

Dominic Fulginiti
Manager – Municipal Services
Republic Services
Adfulginiti@RepublicServices.com
215-783-9329

Solid Waste Fund - Preliminary Cost of In-House Trash Service
 WEST WHITELAND TOWNSHIP
 Updated 9/19/2024

	2024	2025 Projected	2026 Projected	2027 Projected	2028 Projected	2029 Projected	2030 Projected	2031 Projected	2032 Projected	2033 Projected	2034 Projected
							27%				
Cost of Trash bags	2.08	2.12	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Service fee	89.40	90.00	420.00	420.00	420.00	530.00	530.00	530.00	530.00	530.00	530.00
Avg Cost/Yr; assume 55 bags purchased/yr/household	203.70	206.40	420.00	420.00	420.00	530.00	530.00	530.00	530.00	530.00	530.00
Total Revenues											
INTEREST EARNINGS											
INTEREST - INTEREST EARNINGS - Solid Waste Fund	7,000	2,700	7,000	7,000	7,000	7,000	7,000	7,000	7,000	7,000	7,000
SOLID WASTE REVENUE											
REFUSE BAGS - SOLID WASTE REVENUE - Solid Waste Fund	540,000	550,000									
SERVICE FEES - SOLID WASTE REVENUE - Solid Waste Fund	422,000	425,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,000,000	2,540,000	2,540,000	2,540,000	2,540,000	2,540,000	2,540,000
MISCELLANEOUS REVENUE - SOLID WASTE REVENUE - Solid Waste Fund	200,000	0	9,000	9,000	9,000	9,000	9,000	9,000	9,000	9,000	9,000
SOLID WASTE LATE FEES - SOLID WASTE REVENUE - Solid Waste Fund	2,500	2,000	26,000	26,000	26,000	26,000	26,000	26,000	26,000	26,000	26,000
Sub Total SOLID WASTE REVENUE	1,164,500	977,000	2,035,000	2,035,000	2,035,000	2,575,000	2,575,000	2,575,000	2,575,000	2,575,000	2,575,000
ENTITLEMENTS & GRANTS											
SECTION 904 OF ACT 101 - ENTITLEMENTS & GRANTS - Solid Waste Fund	91,000	85,000	92,000	92,000	92,000	92,000	92,000	92,000	92,000	92,000	92,000
Total Total Revenues	1,262,500	1,064,700	2,134,000	2,134,000	2,134,000	2,674,000	2,674,000	2,674,000	2,674,000	2,674,000	2,674,000
Total Expenditures											
ESTIMATED SOLID WASTE EXPENSES*											
CONTRACTED SERVICES - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Hauler (Trash & Recycle)	812,245	831,250	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
SOLID WASTE - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Tipping Fees & Total Recycle (3% Inc)	292,000	280,000	288,400	297,052	305,964	315,142	324,597	334,335	344,365	354,696	365,336
SOLID WASTE - IT maintenance	3,000	3,000	5,000	5,100	5,202	5,306	5,412	5,520	5,631	5,743	5,858
GENERAL SUPPLIES - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES	238,000	23,000	58,350	60,100	61,903	63,760	65,673	67,643	69,672	71,763	73,915
SOLICITORS - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES	0	500	1,591	1,639	1,688	1,739	1,791	1,845	1,900	1,957	2,016
SALARIES - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES	1,500	1,530	379,090	394,249	410,013	426,408	443,459	461,191	479,633	498,812	518,757
UTILITIES - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES	1,650	2,000	15,914	16,391	16,883	17,389	17,911	18,448	19,002	19,572	20,159
Sub Total Estimated SOLID WASTE EXPENSES	1,348,395	1,141,280	748,345	774,531	801,653	829,745	858,843	888,982	920,202	952,543	986,042
Estimated New											
Diesel - Solid Waste - Solid Waste Fund	0	0	127,308	131,127	135,061	139,113	143,286	147,585	152,012	156,573	161,270
Fleet Allocation - Solid Waste Fund	0	0	53,045	54,636	56,275	57,964	59,703	61,494	63,339	65,239	67,196
Healthcare - Solid Waste	0	0	190,962	196,691	202,592	208,669	214,929	221,377	228,019	234,859	241,905
ADVERTISING - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Solid Waste Fund	0	0	13,155	13,550	13,956	14,375	14,806	15,250	15,708	16,179	16,665
LIFE INSURANCE - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Solid Waste Fund	0	0	530	546	563	580	597	615	633	652	672
LONG TERM DISABILITY - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Solid Waste Fund	0	0	1,061	1,093	1,126	1,159	1,194	1,230	1,267	1,305	1,344
PENSION CONTRIBUTION - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Solid Waste Fund	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
SOCIAL SECURITY/MEDICARE TAX - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Solid Waste Fund	0	0	28,644	29,504	30,389	31,300	32,239	33,207	34,203	35,229	36,286
TRAINING/SEMINAR/SCHOOLS - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Solid Waste Fund	0	0	2,228	2,295	2,364	2,434	2,508	2,583	2,660	2,740	2,822
Transfer to Equipment Replacement Fund - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Solid Was	0	0	106,090	109,273	112,551	115,927	119,405	122,987	126,677	130,477	134,392
WORKER'S COMPENSATION - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Solid Waste Fund	0	0	15,914	16,391	16,883	17,389	17,911	18,448	19,002	19,572	20,159
PROPERTY INSURANCE - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Solid Waste Fund	0	0	9,548	9,835	10,130	10,433	10,746	11,069	11,401	11,743	12,095
Sub Total Estimated New	0	0	548,485	564,941	581,890	599,343	617,324	635,845	654,921	674,568	694,806
Estimated Debt Service \$6M Loan @3% Interest Over 25 yrs	0	0	341,432	341,432	341,432	341,432	341,432	341,432	341,432	341,432	341,432
Total Estimated Expenditures	1,348,395	1,141,280	1,638,262	1,680,904	1,724,975	1,770,520	1,817,599	1,866,259	1,916,556	1,968,543	2,022,280
Transfers In											
Total Transfers In	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.00
Transfers Out											
Transfer to Equipment Replacement Fund - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES	0.00	0.00	200,000.00	200,000.00	200,000.00	200,000.00	200,000.00	200,000.00	200,000.00	200,000.00	200,000.00
Transfer to Technology Fund Fund - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES	0.00	0.00	50,000.00	50,000.00	50,000.00	50,000.00	50,000.00	50,000.00	50,000.00	50,000.00	50,000.00
Total Transfers Out	0.00	0.00	250,000.00	250,000.00	250,000.00	250,000.00	250,000.00	250,000.00	250,000.00	250,000.00	250,000.00
Operating Results											
Net Operating Result ((85,895)	(76,580)	245,738	203,096	159,025	653,480	606,401	557,741	507,444	455,457	401,720
Fund Balance											
Starting Fund Balance	507,481	421,586	345,006	590,744	793,840	952,865	1,606,345	2,212,746	2,770,487	3,277,932	3,733,388
Surplus/Deficit	(85,895)	(76,580)	245,738	203,096	159,025	653,480	606,401	557,741	507,444	455,457	401,720
Ending Fund Balance	421,586	345,006	590,744	793,840	952,865	1,606,345	2,212,746	2,770,487	3,277,932	3,733,388	4,135,108

Solid Waste Fund - Anticipated Cost of PAYT Program with 2024 Low Bidder Results
 WEST WHITELAND TOWNSHIP
 Updated 9/19/2024

	2024	2025 Projected	2026 Projected	2027 Projected	2028 Projected	2029 Projected	2030 Projected	2031 Projected	2032 Projected	2033 Projected	2034 Projected
Cost of Trash bags	\$ 2.08	\$ 2.50	\$ 2.50	\$ 2.50	\$ 2.50	\$ 2.50	\$ 2.50	\$ 2.50	\$ 2.50	\$ 2.50	\$ 2.50
Service fee	\$ 89.00	\$ 89.00	\$ 270.00	\$ 300.00	\$ 330.00	\$ 350.00	\$ 370.00	\$ 390.00	\$ 420.00	\$ 450.00	\$ 500.00
Avg Cost/Yr; assume 55 bags purchased/yr/household	\$ 203.30	\$ 226.50	\$ 407.50	\$ 437.50	\$ 467.50	\$ 487.50	\$ 507.50	\$ 527.50	\$ 557.50	\$ 587.50	\$ 637.50
<i>Annual Rate of Increase (Resident Service Fee)</i>			203.37%	11.11%	10.00%	6.06%	5.71%	5.41%	7.69%	7.14%	11.11%
SOLID WASTE REVENUES											
INTEREST - INTEREST EARNINGS - Solid Waste Fund	7,000	2,700	2,700	2,700	2,700	2,700	2,700	2,700	2,700	2,700	2,700
SOLID WASTE REVENUE											
REFUSE BAGS - SOLID WASTE REVENUE - Solid Waste Fund (220,000K bags/year @ \$2.50/bag)	540,000	550,000	550,000	550,000	550,000	550,000	550,000	550,000	550,000	550,000	550,000
SERVICE FEES - SOLID WASTE REVENUE - Solid Waste Fund (4780 Customers)	422,000	425,000	1,277,000	1,404,700	1,545,170	1,668,784	1,768,911	1,857,356	1,968,798	2,145,989	2,360,588
MISCELLANEOUS REVENUE - SOLID WASTE REVENUE - Solid Waste Fund (P-Card Incentive)	200,000	0	13,086	13,878	14,706	15,885	17,154	18,522	20,007	21,609	23,337
SOLID WASTE LATE FEES - SOLID WASTE REVENUE - Solid Waste Fund	2,500	2,000	2,400	2,880	3,168	3,485	3,659	3,842	4,034	4,236	4,448
SUBTOTAL SOLID WASTE REVENUE	1,171,500	979,700	1,845,186	1,974,158	2,115,744	2,240,853	2,342,424	2,432,420	2,545,539	2,724,534	2,941,073
<i>Annual Rate of Increase (Revenues)</i>		<i>-16.37%</i>	<i>88.34%</i>	<i>6.99%</i>	<i>7.17%</i>	<i>5.91%</i>	<i>4.53%</i>	<i>3.84%</i>	<i>4.65%</i>	<i>7.03%</i>	<i>7.95%</i>
ENTITLEMENTS & GRANTS											
SECTION 904 OF ACT 101 - ENTITLEMENTS & GRANTS - Solid Waste Fund	91,000	85,000	85,000	85,000	85,000	85,000	85,000	85,000	85,000	85,000	85,000
Total Revenues	1,262,500	1,064,700	1,930,186	2,059,158	2,200,744	2,325,853	2,427,424	2,517,420	2,630,539	2,809,534	3,026,073
SOLID WASTE EXPENSES											
CONTRACTED SERVICES - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Hauler (Trash & Recycle)	812,245	831,250	1,454,000	1,542,000	1,634,000	1,765,000	1,906,000	2,058,000	2,223,000	2,401,000	2,593,000
SOLID WASTE - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Tipping Fees & Total Recycle (3% Inc)	292,000	280,000	288,400	297,052	305,964	315,142	324,597	334,335	344,365	354,696	365,336
GENERAL SUPPLIES - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Solid Waste Fund (2% inc)	238,000	23,000	23,460	23,929	24,408	24,896	25,394	25,902	26,420	26,948	27,487
IT MAINTENANCE - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Solid Waste Fund	3,000	3,000	3,121	3,184	3,247	3,312	3,378	3,446	3,515	3,585	3,657
OVERTIME/REG - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Solid Waste Fund	1,500	1,530	30,000								
COMMUNICATIONS - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Solid Waste Fund	1,650	2,000	1,040	1,061	1,082	1,104	1,126	1,148	1,171	1,195	1,219
SOLICITORS - SOLID WASTE EXPENSES - Solid Waste Fund	0	500	520	531	541	552	563	574	586	598	609
Debt Service											
Total Expenditures	1,348,395	1,141,280	1,800,541	1,897,757	1,999,241	2,140,006	2,291,057	2,453,405	2,629,057	2,818,021	3,021,308
<i>Annual Rate of Increase (Expenses)</i>		<i>-15.36%</i>	<i>57.77%</i>	<i>5.40%</i>	<i>5.35%</i>	<i>7.04%</i>	<i>7.06%</i>	<i>7.09%</i>	<i>7.16%</i>	<i>7.19%</i>	<i>7.21%</i>
Operating Results											
Net Operating Result	(85,895)	(76,580)	129,645	161,401	201,503	185,847	136,366	64,016	1,482	(8,487)	4,765
Fund Balance											
Starting Fund Balance	507,481	421,586	345,006	474,651	636,052	837,555	1,023,402	1,159,769	1,223,784	1,225,266	1,216,779
Surplus/Deficit	(85,895)	(76,580)	129,645	161,401	201,503	185,847	136,366	64,016	1,482	(8,487)	4,765
Ending Fund Balance	421,586	345,006	474,651	636,052	837,555	1,023,402	1,159,769	1,223,784	1,225,266	1,216,779	1,221,543



**Evaluation
of
Trash & Recycling Program
Options**

I. Executive Summary

Staff is evaluating options to potentially institute a municipally managed waste collection system in the Township of West Whiteland. The Township currently has a municipal-based solid waste collection program, Pay-as-you-Throw (PAYT), for approximately 2/3 of its residents while the other third of residents and all commercial entities independently contract for this service. This study compares the two viable options available for trash collection and disposal including the option to institute a municipal-owned waste collection system in the Township. It shall be noted that solid waste collection shall include the collection and disposal of solid trash, recyclables, bulk items, yard and leaf waste and Christmas trees.

Currently, the Township is in the fourth year of a five-year contract with A.J. Blosenski. NOTE: The fourth and fifth year of the contract are optional years. The Township and surrounding municipalities have encountered service issues over the past two years which have spurred the need to look at alternative collection methods.

Two (2) main options are under consideration to determine which option is the most feasible to collect and dispose of the Township's solid waste. The first option (Option 1) evaluated was to publicly bid a contract to an outside company for the collection, transportation, and disposal of solid waste and recycling materials. The second option (Option 2) evaluated was to have the Township provide these services in-house and provide all equipment and labor necessary to accomplish this task. Both options evaluated will keep the current contract in place through 2025 which has the Township's solid waste collection program remain as-is with A.J. Blosenski (now Waste Connections).

Municipalities within the area who have recently bid their solid waste contracts in the past year have been met with costs at 30-50% higher than their most recent rates. Upper Uwchlan Township opened their solid waste bids on Monday, March 11 with the results coming in at an increase of 55%. West Whiteland Township opened solid waste bids on July 31 resulting in a 70% increase over next year's 2025 pricing.

The main goals of the solid waste collection service are to secure a trash and recycling program that provides excellent service for the residents while keeping their costs down. In addition, the goal would be for the recycling to increase recycling to meet the Township's sustainability goals and increase the grant funding. The program should also be equitable to all participants while saving landfill space.

II. Background Information

Overview

The Township of West Whiteland currently has the Pay-As-You-Throw (PAYT) solid waste collection program in place. According to the estimated census count for 2024, there are approximately 20,600 residents living within the Township with approximately 6,300 residential units. Of the 6,300 residential units, approximately 4,800 are part of the PAYT Program.

The Township is also home to approximately 1,100 commercial properties. These properties are responsible for their own solid waste disposal. The Township has several Township-owned properties that require solid waste collection. These areas include parks and municipal government sites. Currently, the Township pays a contractor to collect solid waste at these municipal sites.

A snapshot of the Pay-As-You-Throw Trash & Recycling Collection:

- West Whiteland Township (WWT) adopted the Pay-As-You-Throw (PAYT) collection system in the early 1990s as a means to promote recycling in the community.
- Residents purchase special 30-gallon trash bags for \$2.50 each and must place ALL trash (aside from one bulk item per week) into these bags.
- Therefore, households who generate more trash automatically pay more for its collection.
- Recycling is placed in any rigid-sided container. All recycling is mixed (i.e., single stream)
- By definition, those households that generate more trash purchase more WWT bags.
- It is low-cost. Residents pay \$89 annually for weekly collection, which includes recycling, one bulk item per week and eleven-yard waste pick-ups, including one collection exclusively for Christmas trees.

Residents' Reactions to the Existing PAYT Program

- Some households embrace the PAYT program because it saves them money and they like that it incentivizes recycling in the community.
- For the most part, these households tend to be the older residents who do not generate as much waste.
- Other households do NOT love the program, and these are the ones we are more likely to hear from.
- Larger families may find it inconvenient to buy and use the WWT bags for all their trash. Some would rather pay more for traditional service.
- Some residents report that animals rip their bags open. (We do ask that the bags are placed directly at the curb, noticeable to the haulers)
- It has been noted that requiring the use of an additional plastic bag to hold smaller plastic bags is wasteful.

- The Township surveyed all the PAYT households in 2019 and again in 2022 to decide whether or not to keep the program.
- While half of the households in 2022 still support the program, those households who prefer a traditional program are growing.

Municipal Visits and Data

Township staff coordinated visits to West Chester Borough and West Bradford Township in order to view their trash and recycling operations (including leaf and yard waste, bulk) and facilities.

*Data pending from Phoenixville Borough and Haverford Township.

Municipality	Area in Square Miles	Roadway Miles	Number of Residences Serviced	Cost	Population	Number of Trucks	Number of CDL Drivers	Number of Mechanics
West Bradford	18.59	77	4,800	\$325/year	13,123	6	6	Outsource
West Chester	1.8	28	6,000		18,630	8	5	2
West Whiteland	13.26	70	6,300	\$119 +/-year	20,600	4 (Blosenski)	8 (Blosenski)	0

The West Chester Area Council of Governments held a panel discussion with West Chester Borough, Phoenixville Borough and West Bradford Township staff and elected officials on Wednesday, April 17th at West Bradford Township to discuss the pros, cons, program details and growing pains of their existing trash and collection programs.

Physical Constraints and Assumptions

Our staff made several assumptions for the purpose of completing this study and accurately modeling the costs associated with each of the three options. Those assumptions include the following:

- **Option 1:** It was assumed that contracted value for collection and disposal would increase by 30-55% for a period of three to five years, as our waste disposal contracts usually last approximately three years with two one-year options to renew.
- **Option 2:** It was assumed that the Township has the space to store its own compost and yard waste and the space to construct a building (pole barn structure) to store equipment and house

personnel. It was also assumed that the Township would have to purchase the equipment necessary to pick up trash, recycling, bulk items and yard and leaf waste.

Tipping Fee

The tipping fee is the cost to dump collected trash at a permitted disposal site. In order to estimate the annual tipping fee for the Township, it was assumed that the existing tipping fee budget would remain as is.

According to our existing data, the average tipping fee is \$80/ ton. Based on the Township' s population data and a tipping fee of \$80 per ton of waste, it was determined that the annual tipping fee is approximately \$320,000 per year. Please note that this price does not include the tipping fees for non-PAYT program participants and the commercial properties. The following table is a breakdown of the annual tipping fee costs:

Average Annual Tonnage	Tipping Fee \$/Ton	Estimated Annual Tipping Fees
4,000 T	\$80.00	\$320,000.00

III. Options for Waste Disposal

The Pennsylvania Department of Environmental Protection mandates the collection of trash, recyclables , compost , and bulk items such as tires, furniture and appliances. Two (2) main options were evaluated to determine the most feasible way to collect solid waste in the Township. The options were evaluated based on feasibility, implementation logistics, and annual out-of-pockets costs. Both options include continuing with the current contract through 2025. Those options are described below:

OPTION 1. Contracted Township-Wide Trash Collection

The price for an annual contract was determined based on the average increase that surrounding municipalities' bids are coming in at with the most current one in Upper Uwchlan Township as of 3/11/24, which came in at 55% higher than the current contract.

OPTION 2. Township-Owned and Operated Trash Collection

This option would require the Township to purchase required equipment, hire new personnel and institute a collection policy to enable Township staff members to conduct trash collection. The start-up cost is approximated to be between \$4,000,000 and \$6,000,000 depending on variables such as the initial investment in equipment and a facility to house the equipment.

The Township would need to make an initial and long-term investment in collection vehicles, construction and maintenance of a new building to store equipment, addition of new personnel, and acquisition of the necessary insurance coverage.

We have a customer service response system to accommodate residential concerns in place already.

The price for a Township owned collection operation was determined by interviewing neighboring municipalities who currently have a municipally owned and operated collection operation. Equipment included for start-up costs were garbage trucks, recycling trucks, and 64-gallon and 96-gallon trash totes. (NOTE: We have a fully-funded grant for recycling totes now.) Additional start-up costs include the design and construction of the building for equipment at the Public Works complex off of Valley Creek Boulevard.

Items considered for annual costs include tipping fees, personnel, insurance, fuel, collection of bulk items, collection of compost materials, replacement totes, and annual equipment maintenance.

IV. Costs

Estimated Start-Up Costs:

Waste & Recycling	Quantity	Waste & Recycling	Budget
Garbage Trucks with GPS (new)	3	\$400,000	\$1,200,000
Recycling Trucks with GPS (new)	3	\$400,000	\$1,200,000
Scout Trucks (new)	2	\$100,000	\$200,000
Building	1	\$2,375,000	\$2,375,000
64 or 96-gallon totes	4,800 for trash and 1,000 for recycling	\$70	\$406,000
TOTAL			\$5,381,000

Estimated Annual Operating Costs (one collection/week, services remain as is):

Waste & Recycling	Budget
Salaries (5 Drivers, 1 Admin, and .5 Mechanic)	\$ 350,000
Disability	\$ 1,500
Medical & Rx, Vision, Dental	\$ 180,000
Life insurance	\$ 3,000
Pension	\$ 14,000
FICA & Medicare	\$ 27,000
Unemployment Compensation	\$ 500
Worker's Compensation	\$ 15,000
Supplies	\$ 55,000
General expense	\$ 25,000
Diesel fuel	\$ 120,000
Uniforms	\$ 5,000
Advertising & Printing	\$ 12,400

Building utilities	\$ 15,000
Vehicle maintenance	\$ 50,000
Landfill fees (tipping)	\$ 320,000
Recycling costs	\$ 100,000
Legal expenses	\$ 1,500
Insurance	\$ 9,000
Training costs	\$ 2,100
Equipment replacement fund	\$ 200,000
	\$ 1,506,000

User Waste Collection Fee based on start-up costs of \$5,000,000 - \$6,000,000 and annual operating costs of \$1,506,000.

(See attached cost forecast)

Options for paying for start-up Costs:

- Borrow from Reserves and Pay the General Fund Back with Interest through Service Fees (included above).
- Low interest loan through PennVest
- Grant – RACP, 902, LSA
- Remaining bond funds depending on auction proceeds paid back by recipients of service

Timeline

Solid Waste Evaluation Process Timeline to include Analysis of **Option 1 and **Option 2**:**

Timing	Option 1	Option 2
May – June 2024	Refine Solid Waste Specs	Funding Sources Determined and Secured Specs determined for Trash & Recycling Facility Finalize list of Equipment Needed
July 2024	Go out to Bid for Services to start 1/1/26	Prepare Bid for Trash & Recycling Facility (Location – 121 Valley Creek Blvd.)
August - September 2024	Board Accepts or Rejects Solid Waste Bids (If the Bids are Rejected, Placeholder to Rebid)	Gather quotes on equipment needed and demo the products
July 2024 – September 2025		Grant Applications for Facility and Equipment
March 2025 – September 2025		Go live with Bid for the Trash & Recycling Facility;

(Dependent on funding stream)		<p>Board Accepts or Rejects Trash & Recycling Facility Bid (If the Bids are Rejected, then Placeholder to Rebid, Go with Contracted Services or Proceed with Equipment Purchase and No Facility – discuss ramifications of no facility on the breakdown of trucks and additional maintenance)</p> <p>Order trash and recycling trucks and equipment</p>
March 2025	Solid Waste Contract is Rebid and Bids Accepted or Rejected	Trash & Recycling Facility Construction Begins with Completion date of March 2026
July 2025 – December 2025		<p>Hiring, Onboarding and Training Process begins for New Team Members & Drivers NOTE: 2 of our existing staff have trash & recycling experience including supervisory experience</p> <p>Trash & Recycling Team Training is Underway with on-the-job training with the West Bradford team and In-House (Shadows Current Trash and Recycling Routes, Updating GPS Devices, Etc.)</p> <p>Receipt of Trash & Recycling Trucks</p>
January 1, 2026	New Contract in Place	In-House Solid Waste Program Starts 1/1/26, if ready. If not, contract extension secured and in-house begins by June 2026.

Next Steps and Considerations:

- Discussion of Pros and Cons of each approach.
- Proceed with both options, option 1, or option 2?
- Develop marketing and public info approach and timing (Now – mid-2026) as either option will mean a change and cost increase to residents for the service.